

Criteria for Survival

Day 2 - Identity

Criteria for Survival

Person A at time 1

Person B at time 2

What has to be true for person B to be numerically identical to person A?

Criteria for Survival

Some proposals:

- Person B must have the same body as person A.

This is the *body criterion*

- Person B's memories must include person A's memories.

This is the *memory criterion*

Criteria for Survival

Some proposals:

- Person B must have the same soul as person A.

This is the *soul criterion*

Some problems

- Person B must have the same body as person A.

This is the *body criterion*

Defenders of the *body criterion* owe us an account of what is required of B's body to be judged the same as A's body.

Some problems

- Person B must have the same body as person A.

This is the *body criterion*

Do transplants threaten this type of identity?
Kidney, liver, heart, lung transplants? Prosthetic limbs?

Some problems

- Person B must have the same body as person A.

This is the *body criterion*

Many proponents of the body criterion retreat to the brain. Person B must have the same brain as person A. Everything else can be replaced.

Some problems

- Person B must have the same brain as person A.

This is the *brain criterion*

We will see that proponents of this criterion also have questions to answer.

Some problems

- Person B must have the same brain as person A.

This is the *brain criterion*

What if person B has had the left hemisphere of her brain removed, to lessen the severity of epileptic seizures?

Some problems

- Person B must have the same brain as person A.

This is the *brain criterion*

What if person B has had his corpus callosum removed (it joins the two hemispheres of the brain), to lessen the severity of epileptic seizures?

Some problems

- Person B's memories must include person A's memories.

This is the *memory criterion*

Defenders of the memory criterion must deal with cases of amnesia, and the tragic loss of memory and other mental capacities brought about by Alzheimer's disease.

Some problems

- Person B must have the same soul as person A.

This is the *soul criterion*

Defenders of the soul criterion frequently maintain that the soul is immaterial, which explains why anatomical research has not discovered it, and allows for its survival after death.

Some problems

- Person B must have the same soul as person A.

This is the *soul criterion*

But if it *is* immaterial, and cannot be seen or touched or detected by scientific instruments, then the advocate of the soul criterion owes us an explanation of i) how it interacts with the body, and ii) how we know that it remains the **same** soul through time.